THEO 83408, 01: TOPICS IN LITURGICAL STUDIES

THE ANAPHORA

Maxwell E. Johnson
Office: Malloy 432
Office Hours: TBA
or by Appointment (631-4118)

Course Description:

This course will examine the origins, evolution, variant structures, and theologies of the Anaphora (Prosphora, Canon, or Eucharistic Prayer), the central prayer of the central act of liturgical worship within the Christian community. The primary focus of this course is the study of the classic anaphoral sources of Christian antiquity, although some current official liturgical texts may also be examined critically.

Class Format:

This seminar, primarily, is a close reading of classical eucharistic prayer texts in original languages and/or translations aided by the insights of modern liturgical scholarship. It will proceed in a graduate seminar fashion in which each participant will make individual (assigned/chosen) contributions toward a common goal. What this means, concretely, is that the members of the group will depend upon each other as mutual teachers who are responsible individually for specific (assigned/chosen) topics although it is expected that all will have read the materials in question before each class session so that the discussion will be an informed one.

Goals and Objectives:

This course intends to assist doctoral students in Liturgical Studies and others in acquiring:

1. A thorough knowledge of the origins, evolution, and theology of the Eucharistic Prayer according to its various expressions within the diverse Ecclesial Rites of the Church in the patristic period;
2. An ability to evaluate critically the current Eucharistic Prayers prayed within the diverse Rites of the Church today from the perspective gained by #1 above; and
3. Greater facility in doing liturgical research at the doctoral level.
Course Requirements:

The above goals and objectives will be met by:

1. Attendance at and participation in all class sessions;
2. Keeping up with the Assigned Required Reading;
3. A Series of Short (4-5 page) Seminar-Style Reports and Summaries of particular key essays (erserve) and other texts (either purchased or on library reserve) dealing with the development and theology of specific eucharistic prayer texts. These reports are to be delivered orally and are to be photo-copied for distribution to the rest of the class at the time of the oral presentation.

(NOTE: summaries/reports are not only to be descriptive but also evaluative of contents and it is assumed that the TEXT(S) of the prayers as included in Prex Eucharistica and/or other collections are of major importance). Also, because Mazza’s Origins is our major secondary text book, it is assumed that these short papers will be in critical dialogue with his study;

4. A Research paper of journal article length and quality describing the evolution, structure, and theology of a select Eucharistic Prayer and evaluating its structure and theology (and, if appropriate, its English translation) or a particular problem in the evolution of the anaphora (e.g., sanctus, institution narrative, theology of eucharistic sacrifice, etc.). Other topics may be chosen in consultation with the instructor. This paper will be presented to the class during the last few weeks of the course as indicated below.

REQUIRED TEXTS AND READING WITH ABBREVIATIONS

(Abbreviations plus page numbers are used to indicate required reading under topics assigned to specific days in the Schedule of Classes)

Origins = E. Mazza, The Origins of the Eucharistic Prayer


IEP = M. Johnson (ed.), Issues in Eucharistic Praying in East and
ADDITIONAL TEXTS AND READING WITH ABBREVIATIONS
(On Library Reserve)


NOTE: All readings from articles are on Electronic Reserve and may be accessed as follows:

HYPERLINK "https://library.nd.edu/eresources/ereserves/course.cgi?course=2013F_THEO_83408_01"

The course can also be accessed by going to the University Libraries website at <http://www.library.nd.edu/> and clicking on the Electronic Reserves link located under Library Services.

SUGGESTED RESEARCH PAPER TOPICS

1. Cyril of Jerusalem and the Anaphora of St. James
2. The “Basilian” Anaphorae
3. The Roman *Canon missae*
4. The Barcelona and Louvain Coptic Papyri; Bradshaw vs. Zheltov
5. The Institution Narrative and Its Interpolation into the Anaphora
6. The Theology of Eucharistic Sacrifice and Early Anaphoral Texts
7. The Anaphora of St. Mark and the Egyptian Eucharistic Liturgies

TENTATIVE SCHEDULE OF CLASSES AND
TOPICS

I. INTRODUCTORY MATERIALS

M, Sept 2:  A.  Introduction to the Course, Selection of Report and Research Topics
           B.  The Eucharistic Liturgy: Historical and Theological Overview I

M, Sept 9:  The Eucharistic Liturgy: Historical and Theological Overview II

II. UNIT ONE: The Eucharistic Prayer(s) In The Pre-Nicene Church(es)


M, Sept 16:  Jewish Prayers and the Origins of the Eucharistic Prayer
            Assigned Reading:  PE, 5-67;  PEER, pp. 3-24, 39-54, 101-102

1.  For Report and/or Summary: ______________________


2.  For Report and/or Summary: ______________________


3.  For Report and/or Summary: ______________________


M, Sept 23:  Pre-Nicene Eucharistic Prayers I
            Assigned Reading:  PE, 68-81, 375-380, 405-420; PEER, 25-38 (Justin Martyr and the (so-called) *Apostolic Tradition* of Hippolytus); Origins of the Eucharistic Dialogue
1. For Report and/or Summary (Addai and Mari): ______________________
B. Spinks, “The Quest for the ‘Original Form’ of the Anaphora of the Apostles Addai and
Mari,” and “The Original Form of the Anaphora of the Apostles: A Suggestion in the
Light of Maronite Sharar ,” in idem, Worship: Prayers From the East (The Pastoral
Addai and Mari ,” (IEP, chapter 2); S. Wilson, “The Anaphora of the Apostles Addai and
Mari,” (EEEP, chapter 1).

2. For Report and/or Summary (Justin):_________________
G. Cuming, “DI’ EUCHES LOGOU (Justin Apology 1.66.2),” Journal of Theological
Eucharist of the Early Christians (Pueblo: Collegeville 1978), pp. 71-85; M. Heintz,

M, Sept 30: Pre-Nicene Eucharistic Prayers II

1. For Report and/or Summary (ApTrad): ____________________
(Grove Books Ltd.: Bramcote/Nottingham 1978), pp. 39-51; E.C. Ratcliff, “The Sanctus
and the Pattern of the Early Anaphora,” Journal of Ecclesiastical History 1 (1950):
29-36, 125-134. See also: P. Bradshaw, “Introduction: The Evolution of Early
Anaphoras,” in EEEP: 1-18; Idem, “Redating the Apostolic Tradition: Some Preliminary
Steps,” in J. Baldovin and N. Mitchell (eds.), Rule of Prayer, Rule of Faith: Essays in
Honor of Aidan Kavanagh, OSB (Collegeville 1996): 3-17; Matthieu Smyth, “The
Anaphora of the So-called ‘Apostolic Tradition’ and the Roman Eucharistic Prayer,” in
IEP, chapter IV; See also P. Bradshaw, M. Johnson, and L.E. Phillips, The Apostolic

2. For Report and/or Summary (Dialogue): _____________________
Opening Greeting,” Orientalia Christiana Periodica 52 (1986): 299-324; “II: The
thanks to the Lord - It is fitting and right,” Orientalia Christiana Periodica 55 (1989):
63-74.

III. UNIT TWO: THE NICENE AND POST-NICENE PERIOD

GENERAL REQUIRED READING: Origins, pp. 177-338; Fenwick,
TECHNIQUES, and OBLATION.

1. SUMMARY DISCUSSION OF THE PRE-NICENE PERIOD

2. Eucharistic Prayers in the Nicene and Post-Nicene Period I
   A. Jerusalem and Egypt
      Assigned Reading: PE, pp. 101-141; PEER, 52-99; Origins, pp. 177-239; Fenwick, TECHNIQUES.

1. Special Reading for Report and/or Summary (Egypt): ______________

B. Jerusalem
   Assigned Reading: PE, pp. 204-210; PEER, 100-142; Fenwick, OBLATION.

1. For Report and/or Summary (Jerusalem): _____________


Reading: Origins, pp. 287-331; PE, pp. 82-100, 210-275; PEER as above

A. Antioch

1. Special Reading for Report and/or Summary (Antioch): ______________
   Fenwick, OBLATION (Focus on Apostolic Constitutions, Bk. VIII and Twelve Apostles); Raphael Graves, “The Anaphora of the Eighth Book of the Apostolic Constitutions,” EEEP, chapter 8.

B. Constantinople

1. Special Reading for Report and/or Summary (Constantinople): _________
   Fenwick, OBLATION (Focus on St John Chrysostom); R. Taft, “The Authenticity of the Chrysostom Anaphora Revisited. Determining the Authorship of Liturgical
M, Oct 21: Mid-Semester Break


A. Rome - Non-Roman and Roman Witnesses to the Canon Missae
   Assigned Reading: PE, pp. PEER, pp. 143-146; 155-173

1. For Report and/or Summary (Non-Roman): ____________
   K. Stevenson, Eucharist and Offering, pp. 74-90; A Bouley, From Freedom to Formula, pp. 200-215. (Focus primarily on Ambrose and non-Roman witnesses)

2. For Report and/or Summary (Rome): _________________
   K. Stevenson, Eucharist and Offering, pp. 74-90; A Bouley, From Freedom to Formula, pp. 200-215. (Focus on Roman witnesses)

B. The Basilian and Saint James Anaphoras

1. For Reports and/or summary: _________________

2. The Anaphoras of St. James; _________________

M, Nov 4:

B. The Problem of the Sanctus and Epiclesis

1. For Report and/or Summary:


3. For Report and/or Summary: __________________________

M, Nov 11: The Problem of the Sanctus and Epiclesis (cont.)

1. For Report and/or Summary: __________________________

2. SUMMARY DISCUSSION OF THE NICENE AND POST- NICENE PERIOD


V. UNIT THREE: STUDENT RESEARCH PAPERS

M, Nov 25: Student Presentations of Research ________________;
______________.

M, Dec 2: Student Presentations of Research ________________;
______________.
M, DEC 9: Student Presentations of Research

Final Discussion/Summary: Where Do We Go From Here?
SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY ON THE ANAPHORA
Rev. August, 2013 by Maxwell E. Johnson

I. GENERAL

COLLECTIONS OF TEXTS:


A. Hänggi, I. Pahl (eds.), *Prex Eucharistica. textus e variis liturgiis antiquioribus selecti*. Editio secunda. (= Spicilegium Friburgense 12) Fribourg 1968. (prints Greek and Latin texts where available; other languages in Latin translation)


STUDIES:


G. Dix, *The Shape of the Liturgy* .

London 1945.


London 1938.


J.H. McKenna, *Eucharist and Holy Spirit* (= Alcuin Club Collections 57)

Great Wakering 1975.


B. Spinks, “Berakah, Anaphoral Theory and Luther,” *Lutheran Quarterly* III, 3


R. Taft, “Was the Eucharistic Anaphora Recited Secretly or Aloud? The Ancient Tradition and


(1997):
363-420.

II. EARLY EUCHARISTIC PRAYER TEXTS AND RELATED LITURGICAL DOCUMENTS

DIDACHE

Editions

a) Greek:

P. Bryennios, DIDACHE TON DODEKA APOSTOLON. Constantinople 1883.

[Bibliography 129-135]
b) Coptic:

Schmidt, “Das koptische Didache-Fragment des British Museum,” ZNW 24 (1925) 81-99 [with German translation].

Translation:


Bibliographies of secondary literature

B. Altaner, Patrologie (9th edn, Freiburg 1978), 82 and 557.
Rordorf and Tuiler, 129-135.

Other Studies

a) general:


b) “Eucharist”: chs 9 and 10


JUSTIN MARTYR

Editions


Studies


E.C. Ratcliff, “Justin Martyr and Confirmation,” Theology 51 (1948) 133-139 = A.H.

APOTOLIC TRADITION

Editions and translations

B. Botte, La Tradition Apostolique de saint Hippolyte. LQF 39, Münster 1963; 5th edn 1989, with Addenda by A Gerhards [Latin text; composite Oriental text in Latin; French translation].
E. Hauler, 101-121 [Latin text].
G. Horner, [Arabic and Ethiopic texts; English translation].
J. and A Perier, Les 127 Canons des apôtres. PO 8/4, Paris 1912 [Arabic text].
H. Duensing, Der aethiopische Text der Kirchenordnung des Hippolyt. AGWG.PH 3/32, Göttingen 1946 [with German translation].
W. Till and J. Leipoldt, Der koptische Text der Kirchenordnung Hippolyts. TU 58/5, Berlin 1954 [with German translation].
E. Tidner, 115-150 [Latin text].

Bibliographies of secondary literature

Altaner, 82-84, 557-8.
Bradshaw, “Kirchenordnungen,” 668.

Other Studies

a) general:

A. Brent, Hippolytus and the Roman Church in the Third Century: Communities in
Tension

before the Emergence of a Monarch-Bishop (Leiden 1995).


b) eucharist:


THE ANAPHORA OF THE APOSTLES ADDAI AND MARI

Edition


Translation


Bibliography of secondary literature

Spinks (as above), 32-33
Other Studies


BARCELONA PAPYRUS


Ramón Roca-Puig, Anàfora de Barcelona I altres pregàries (Barcelona 1994)


STRASBOURG PAPYRUS 254
Edition


Studies


THE DEIR BALYZEH PAPYRUS

Edition


Studies

__________, “Der liturgische Papyrus von Deir el Bala’izah in Oberagypeten (6./7.Jh),”

**PRAYERS OF SARAPION OF THMUIS**

*Editions and Translations*


*Studies*


ANAPHORA OF SAINT MARK

Editions


Studies


ETHIOPIAN ANAPHORAS


**APOCRYPHAL ACTS OF THE APOSTLES**

*Editions*


*Studies*


G. Winkler, “Nochmals zu den Anfängen der Epiklese und des Sanctus im

APOSTOLIC CONSTITUTIONS

Editions


Translations

J. Donaldson, ANF 7, 387-505.

Bibliography of secondary literature

Altaner, 256.

Other Studies

__________, Prayers Alleged to be Jewish: An Examination of the Constitutiones Apostolorum.
D. Hagedorn, Der Hiobkommentar des Arianers Julian (Berlin 1973) XXXVII-LVII.

CYRIL OF JERUSALEM

Editions

a) Prebaptismal Catecheses:

J.-P. Minge, Patrologia Graeca.

b) Mystagogical Catecheses:


Translations

E. Yarnold, The Awe-Inspiring Rites of Initiation, 2nd edn, Collegeville 1994 [Mystagogical Catecheses only]

Studies


**ANAPHORA OF SAINT JAMES**


G. Winkler, “’Preliminary Observations About the Relationship Between the Liturgies of St. Basil and St. James”, *Orientalia Christiana Periodica* 76 (2010), 5-55.

**“BASILIAN” ANAPHORAS**

*Editions*

*General*


b) “Egyptian”


b) Byzantine


*Studies*


JOHN CHRYSTOSM: BAPTISMAL CATECHESES

Edition


Translations

E. Yarnold, The Awe-Inspiring Rites of Initiation, 2nd edn, Collegeville 1994 [one homily only].

Studies

R. Taft, “Was the Eucharistic Anaphora Recited Secretly or Aloud? The Ancient Tradition and

What Became of It?,” In R. Ervine (ed.), *Worship Traditions in Armenia and the Neighboring Christian East*, Avant Series 3 (Crestwood: St. Vladimir’s Seminary Press


[OCP = *Orientalia Christiana Periodica* ]
333-383.

**THEODORE OF MOPSUESTIA: CATECHETICAL SERMONS**

*Editions*


*Translations*

a) English:

E. Yarnold, *The Awe-Inspiring Rites of Initiation*, 2nd edn, Collegeville 1994 [sermons 13-16 only].
b) French:


*Studies*


J. Lécuyer, “Le sacerdoce chrétien et le sacrifice eucharistique selon Theodore de Mopsueste,” *RSR* 36 (1949); 481-516.


147-183.


**AMBROSE OF MILAN: DE SACRAMENTIS; DE MYSTERIIS**

*Editions*


*Translation*

E. Yarnold, *The Awe-Inspiring Rites of Initiation*, 2nd edn, Collegeville 1994 [De Sacramentis only].

*Studies*


O Faller, “Ambrosius, der Verfasser von De Sacramentis,” *ZKTh* 64 (1940) 1-14,
81-101.
K. Gamber, “Nochmals zur Frage der Autorschaft von De Sacramentis,” ZKTh 91
R. Johanny, L'eucharistie dentre de l'histoire du salut chez St Ambroise de Milan.
Paris 1968.
L. Lavoral, “oblas et corps du Christ sur l’autel d’apres Saint Ambroise,” RThAM 24
(1957):205-224.
H.M. Riley, Christian Initiation: A Comparative Study of the Interpretation of the
Baptismal Liturgy in the Mystagogical Writings of Cyril of Jerusalem,
John Chrysostom, Theodore of Mopsuestia and Ambrose of Milan
E. Yarnold, “The Ceremonies of Initiation in the De Sacramentis and the De Mysteriis
E. Yarnold, “Did St Ambrose know the Mystagogic Catecheses of St Cyril of Jerusalem?”
SP 12 (1975) 184-189.

ROMAN CANON MISSAE

Editions

B. Botte, Le Canon de la Messe romaine. Louvain 1935.
Prex Eucharistica, 424-426 [with bibliography].

Bibliographies

G.G. Willis, Essays in Early Roman Liturgy.
London 1964 (= Alcuin Club Collections 46).
________, Further Essays in Early Roman Liturgy .
London 1968 (= Alcuin Club Collections 50).

Other Studies

A. Kavanagh, “Thoughts on the Roman Anaphora,” Worship 39, 9 (1965): 515-529; 40,
1 (1966): 2-16.
N. Roy, “The Mother of God, the Forerunner, and the Saints of the Roman Canon: A
Euchological Deësis,” in M. Johnson (ed.), Issues in Eucharistic Praying in East
and West: Essays in Liturgical and Theological Analysis (Collegeville: The
THE PROBLEM OF THE SANCTUS

M. Johnson, “Recent Research on the Anaphoral Sanctus: An Update and Hypothesis,”


G. Winkler, Das Sanctus; Über den Urprung und die Anfänge des Sanctus und sein Fortwirken,
Orientalia Christiana Analecta 267 (Rome 2002).


[OCP = Orientalia Christiana Periodica]
Anaphora is. A speaker or writer will use anaphora with purpose and intent. Weak writers use anaphora on accident—that is not anaphora; that is poor word choice. Strong writers know exactly why they are using anaphora. The repetition that anaphora creates is emphatic and forceful. A good writer knows this and uses this device in order to help him communicate his argument. Modern Examples of Anaphora.